

MINUTES

CITY PLAN COMMISSION/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

MAY 19, 2008

The City Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board of the City of Clayton, Missouri, met upon the above date at 5:30 p.m., Chairman Harold Sanger presiding. Upon roll call, the following responded:

Present

Chairman Harold Sanger
Steve Lichtenfeld, Aldermanic Representative
Lenore Toser-Aldaz, Acting City Manager
Jim Liberman
Debbie Igielnik
Marc Lopata

Absent:

Scott Wilson

Also Present:

Catherine Powers, Director of Planning & Development Services
Jason Jaggi, Planner
Kevin O'Keefe, City Attorney

Chairman Sanger welcomed everyone to the meeting and asked that conversations not take place during the meeting and that all cell phone and pager ringers be turned off. He announced that two of the projects listed on the agenda will not be heard this evening (35 Arundel and 7300 Wydown) at the request of the applicants.

Catherine Powers announced that there will be a change in the order of presentations as listed on the agenda, so as to get the one remaining smaller project out of the way first.

MINUTES

The minutes of the regular meeting of May 5th, 2008 were presented for approval. The minutes were approved after having been previously distributed to each member.

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – ADDITION TO SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE – 77 ABERDEEN PLACE

Mr. Michael Wolff, owner, was in attendance at the meeting.

Catherine Powers explained that this is a request for the construction of a one story addition to be located in place of the existing driveway turnaround at the rear of the structure. The attached rear-entry garage will be demolished and will not be replaced. The existing 2 story brick home contains a small one-story addition on the west side. The proposed addition measures 1,344 square feet and would be brick to match the existing house. Due to the slope of the property, the rear elevation will allow access from the finished basement. Trash and HVAC units are shown within a wrought iron enclosure located on the east side of the house. The plans show the height of the addition will be lower than the existing home at approximately 20-feet from grade to mid-point of roof and will contain black asphalt shingles to match existing. The roof style will be gable compared to the existing hip-style roof. The windows will be white colonial with dividers and will also receive brick rowlock headers similar to the existing house. Impervious coverage is shown at 47 percent, which does not represent a significant change due to the new addition occupying the driveway turnaround. As shown, the plans comply with the rear and side yard setback provisions of the Zoning Ordinance. Hillcrest Subdivision Trustee approval has been submitted. Catherine indicated that overall, the addition blends well with the existing residence; however, staff has concerns with the large amount of windows on the rear of the addition, which seem out of character with the style of this home, but the architect has designed the windows to match existing with divided lights and brick rowlock headers. A replacement garage is not proposed as part of this project and the owners may have difficulty adding a garage in the future due to the City's setback and impervious coverage restrictions. The addition will be occupying previous pavement areas which results in impervious coverage remaining the same. Catherine stated that staff's recommendation is to approve the project as submitted. She reiterated that once this addition is in place, it is very likely that a garage will not be able to be constructed on this site.

Mr. Wolff introduced himself, indicating that he and his wife have lived in this 84 year old brick home for 28 years. He stated that there is concrete between the basement and first floor and concrete between the first and second floors. Photographs of the existing brick and the home were presented to he members. He stated that there is a 1 foot indention on both sides of the house and that they are not removing a valuable part of the structure. He stated the lot is fairly sizeable and that there are utility easements at the rear, but in order to see the windows, one would need to trespass onto their back yard. He stated the brickwork has a couple of patterns which will be replicated in the addition.

Chairman Sanger advised Mr. Wolff that he will not be able to construct a garage once this addition is built.

Mr. Wolff stated that they never put their vehicles in the garage and that he has a storage area that is used for storage.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if the neighbors are okay with the project.

Mr. Wolff replied "yes".

Jim Liberman asked about the rear neighbor.

Mr. Wolff stated that there are a lot of trees separating their properties.

Jim Liberman commented that it is a strange elevation.

Mr. Wolff stated that 73 Aberdeen has a breezeway with a similar configuration.

Jim Liberman asked the reason for the top row of windows above the double hung windows.

Mr. Wolff indicated that they wanted more light.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if the ceiling inside follows the head of the top row of windows.

Mr. Wolff replied “yes”.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked about the neighbor to the east.

Mr. Wolff stated he had no comment from this neighbor. He indicated his willingness to add a window onto that elevation, but would rather not so he does not have a view of their trash area.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if that area of the house is unfinished.

Mr. Wolff replied “yes”.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if there will be a change in the grade.

Mr. Wolff replied “no”. He stated that the grade goes away from the back of the building.

Marc Lopata stated his concern that there is not enough room for the HVAC condensers between the wall and the doors. He asked if the unit is 30” square.

Mr. Wolff indicated that he did not know.

Marc Lopata stated there will be no efficiency if there is less than 4 feet in the enclosure.

Mr. Wolff stated he would check with the contractor.

Marc Lopata informed Mr. Wolff to be sure that, if the unit is left in its current location, there is plenty of room for the doors.

Being no further questions or comments, Jim Liberman made a motion to approve with the conditions that a window be added on the lower level east façade and that staff reviews and approves proper placement for efficiency of the HVAC unit. The motion was seconded by Debbie Igielnik and unanimously approved by the Board.

CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT/SITE PLAN REVIEW/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW –
WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY PHASE 6 – 6500 WYDOWN BLVD.

Mr. Richard Kirschner, project architect with Mackey Mitchell, was in attendance at the meeting. Also in attendance was Sara Koester of Mackey Mitchell.

Catherine Powers explained that the proposed two phase/part project consists of the construction of three new dormitories to replace Wohl, Umrath, and Rubelmann. In addition, a new dining facility is proposed to support the new dormitories and a chiller plant is proposed to serve the South 40 Campus. These dormitories represent Phase 6 of Washington University's plan to replace obsolete dormitories with new construction. The following uses are proposed:

Umrath/Rubelmann Residence Hall

This dormitory will be 119,433 square feet, 5 stories, 58 feet in height and contain 261 beds.

Wohl Building including College Hall Dining Facility

This dormitory will be 153,872 square feet, 5 stories, 48 feet in height and contain 217 beds.

Eliot B Residence Hall

This dormitory will be 76,798 square feet, 6 stories, 68 feet in height and contain 147 beds.

Chiller Plant

The new chiller plant will contain 8,452 square feet and measure 20-feet tall.

Catherine stated that the total size of the project is 358,555 square feet and will contain 625 beds. In addition to the room quarters, there are student activity spaces located in each of the residence halls.

Catherine stated that drainage for the new buildings will be accommodated by connections to the MSD storm sewer system. The University is proposing several storm water best management practices to mitigate the impact of additional water into the sewer system. Proposed are storm water filters, a bio-retention area (rain garden), underground detention area and a green roof over part of the new Wohl dormitory.

With regard to parking, Catherine stated that the University has requested a waiver for 34 required parking spaces until the replacement of obsolete dormitory buildings is complete. This request is in addition to the waiver of 26 spaces carried over from the Phase 4 construction. At the current time, the University is 60 spaces short of meeting the Zoning Ordinance requirement of 1 space per 3 beds. Staff believes there may be an opportunity in future phases to provide some of the parking and would recommend postponing final approval for reduced parking until the phases are further along to assure there are no additional spaces lost and to work with the University related to the current 60 spaces.

Catherine stated that this Phase will involve significant tree removal, including the removal of many large trees. According to the landscape plans and the review by the City's contracted landscape architect, there will be 1,292 caliper inches of trees removed, 153.5-caliper inches relocated, and 351 caliper inches of new trees planted. Most of the relocated trees are being planted along the edge of the campus facing Wydown and Big Bend Boulevards. The University is unable to replace all of the caliper inches on site and is willing to provide a contribution to the City's forestry fund. As presented, the contribution would be \$112,920. The City's landscape architect believes that several additional trees could be relocated along Wydown Boulevard, which could reduce the amount of contribution to the fund. In addition, the landscape architect recommends that additional 8-foot evergreen trees be planted around the east side of the chiller plant for screening.

Catherine noted that a Conditional Use Permit is required because this project is a college expansion within a residential district.

Catherine stated that this Phase of construction is much larger than previous phases and represents a notable increase in the intensity of the South 40 campus although this phase will be located on the interior of the campus and will have minimal visual impact on the adjacent residences. In addition, the new chiller plant is located away from private residences in the nearby Skinker Heights Subdivision. The engineer's study indicates that the noise levels associated with the chiller plant will not exceed St. Louis County's Noise Ordinance. The University proposes to conduct noise testing to ensure compliance with St. Louis County's Noise Ordinance. At this time, the requested waiver of parking is acceptable; however, after the completion of this Phase, the University should work with staff to provide for some of the waived spaces in the upcoming phases. The proposed tree removal is significant, but is necessary due to the placement of the new buildings. To ensure that the trees are located properly, the City's contracted landscape architect should perform at least two site inspections after the trees are staked and again upon installation of the trees. To further ensure successful tree relocation and new plantings, a bond should be provided to the City for a period of one-year after occupancy permits are issued. Catherine stated that staff's recommendation is to approve the Site Plan as presented and recommend to the Board of Aldermen approval of a Conditional Use Permit with the following conditions:

1. That the University agree to relocate trees designated by the City's contracted landscape architect and provide additional evergreen trees on the east side of the chiller plant for staff review in a revised landscape plan,
2. That the City's contracted landscape architect perform a site inspection, to be reimbursed to the City by the University, after the trees are staked and upon installation of the plantings to verify compliance with approved plans,
3. That the applicant contribute to the City's Forestry fund in the amount equal to \$120 per caliper inch of trees not replaced,
4. That a bond in the amount of \$60,540 be provided for a period of one-year after completion of Phase 6 and occupancy permits are issued to ensure survivability of the relocated and newly planted trees, and
5. That a staging area be designated and approved by staff prior to building permit issuance.

Chairman Sanger asked if it would be appropriate to go over the architectural aspects of the project at this time so as to get a complete picture of the project.

Catherine Powers agreed. She provided a description of each building as follows:

Umrath/Rubelmann Hall

This is a 5 story, 58 foot in height building constructed of brick, EIFS, and concrete masonry units (CMU). CMU's are concrete blocks which can be architecturally finished. Secondary materials will be synthetic stone veneer and glass fiber reinforced concrete (GFRC). The dormitory will feature storefronts for student activity on the ground floor. Storefronts will consist of aluminum storefront windows with canvas awnings. Stone trim will be used around the windows. The roofing material is asphalt shingle. This dormitory building will be 119,433 square feet and accommodate 261 beds.

Wohl Center/College Hall

This is a 5 story, 48 foot in height building constructed of brick, EIFS, and CMU. Secondary materials will be synthetic stone veneer and glass fiber reinforced concrete (GFRC). This dormitory will feature aluminum storefronts on the ground floor. The windows will have canvas awnings. The roof will be a combination of asphalt shingles and membrane system to allow a planted green roof on a portion of the roof. A wood pergola is also on site. This building will also contain the one story College Hall designed as meeting and dining space for students. College Hall will be constructed primarily of synthetic stone veneer with standing seam metal dormers. This dormitory will be 153,872 square feet and accommodate 217 beds.

Eliot B Residence Hall

This is a 6 story, 68 foot in height building constructed of brick, EIFS and GFRC. This building will feature aluminum storefronts on the ground floor. The roofing material will be asphalt shingle. This dormitory will be 76,789 square feet and accommodate 147 beds.

Chiller Plant

The University is also proposing to re-locate the chiller plant from the roof of the current Wohl Center to a new location adjacent to Shepley and Wallace. The chiller plant will feature a sub-grade equipment room with a tall parapet to hide the cooling towers. The primary material of the 20 foot tall chiller plant is brick and will feature limestone coping, corner finials and inset panels.

Catherine indicated that Washington University is proposing a pedestrian friendly, environmentally sensitive development and while there are still elements of the previous dormitory construction, this plan strives to provide a street-like atmosphere with student shops on the ground floor and staff recommends approval as submitted.

Chairman Sanger asked for clarification that there are three separate items regarding this project: Conditional Use Permit, Site Plan Review and Architectural Review.

Catherine Powers concurred.

Mr. Kirschner introduced himself.

Chairman Sanger asked about the removal of the police building.

Mr. Kirschner stated it is being moved across the street (Shepley). He stated he will point out its new location later during his PowerPoint presentation.

Mr. Kirschner began the PowerPoint presentation. The first slide depicted pre-development photos of the South 40 Campus. Slides depicting photos of the previous 5 phases and a site plan were also presented.

Mr. Kirschner stated that for sustainability purposes as well as to keep the University competitive, these upgrades are needed. He stated the previous phases were located on the perimeter of the campus, whereas this phase is on the interior of the campus. He stated this phase includes the replacement of Wohl Center. At this time, Mr. Kirschner showed the location of the new police building on the site plan. He stated that Umrath/Rubelmann, which will contain about 243 beds and student activity space, will be constructed in two parts and that part of the Wohl Center's kitchen will be under a green roof.

Jim Liberman asked about food service.

Mr. Kirschner stated that this Phase will be constructed in two parts, with the north part being constructed first that includes a new kitchen. He stated the space above the kitchen will be used for food service.

Debbie Igielnik asked when the existing Wohl Center will be demolished.

Mr. Kirschner indicated that it will be demolished about one year from now.

Samples of the following materials were presented: brick, roof, EIFS, stone (cast), limestone and window.

Slides depicting color renderings of the proposed buildings were presented.

Chairman Sanger asked if the green roof counts towards pervious coverage.

Catherine Powers indicated that in general, no, but a decision could be made to change that.

Mr. Kirschner stated that a decision was made to re-locate the chiller plant further away from the residential area to the corner of Shepley and Wallace. He stated the chiller plant meets or exceeds St. Louis County's requirements with regard to noise (he referred to the noise report that was submitted with the plans). He indicated that the decibel level at the neighboring residences goes down to a 44, which is a significant reduction from the maximum of 55 decibels allowed during the daytime and the maximum 50 decibels allowed at nighttime. He stated that they hope to start construction very soon and to have the Phase completed by the summer of 2011. He advised the members that the University agrees with staff's recommendations about parking. He stated they are working diligently to obtain the Silver LEED level and that the University has agreed to and will

include in their contracts that fines will be levied for working outside approved construction hours. He stated it is the University's desire to minimize the impact to the surrounding residential area.

At this time, Mr. Kirschner provided a brief explanation of the University's future plans. He indicated that after all construction is complete, the campus will contain 75% open space.

Chairman Sanger asked how many beds are included with the construction of this Phase.

Mr. Kirschner indicated that 300 beds are coming out; 600 are going in.

Chairman Sanger asked if this will result in a bed count of over 3,000.

Mr. Kirschner stated that they will not exceed the 3,000 bed commitment.

Slides depicting the Eliot B and Wohl buildings were presented.

Jim Liberman asked for a photo of the new College Hall.

A slide depicting a portion of College Hall was shown.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if any vapor will be emitted from the chiller plant.

Mr. Kirschner indicated that there will be some condensation in certain weather conditions.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if there are two levels in the chiller plant; one being underground.

Mr. Kirschner replied "yes". He stated there are a total of six cooling towers, but that only four need to run and that they only need to run at full speed during the hottest days. He informed the members that the figures provided in the study are based on operation of all six towers.

Debbie Igielnik referred to Attachment B and the demolition of Wohl Center.

Mr. Kirschner stated they hope demolition takes place in the summer of 2009.

Jim Liberman asked to see the site plan which shows the relationship of the chiller plant to the residential neighborhood.

Mr. Kirschner presented a site plan depicting this information. He showed the members the location of where the testing took place. He reminded the members that the University owns 6500 Ellenwood and 3 University Lane.

Marc Lopata asked what criteria is being met with regard to noise levels from the chiller plant.

Mr. Kirschner replied "the County's Noise Ordinance".

Marc Lopata asked if wind out of the northwest was considered.

Mr. Kirschner stated that he did not know.

Marc Lopata asked if there is a line of sight out of the second floor of the adjacent house into the chiller plant.

Mr. Kirschner stated that he does not know that, either. He stated that the grade drops towards the south.

Chairman Sanger asked if the two houses owned by the University are occupied by University personnel.

Mr. Kirschner replied “yes”.

Marc Lopata commented that those houses could be sold in the future.

Jim Liberman asked if they are willing to add more trees as recommended.

Mr. Kirschner replied “yes”; they would be happy to do that.

Marc Lopata asked where the deficiency money goes.

Catherine Powers stated that the money is deposited into the City’s General Revenue account and expended for tree placement throughout the City.

Marc Lopata asked about drainage.

Ms. Koester explained that there is no increase in existing conditions/coverage, but that plans for storm water best management practices are in place to mitigate the impact of additional water into the sewer system, including storm water filters, a bio-retention area (rain garden), underground detention area and a green roof over part of the new Wohl dormitory.

Marc Lopata asked if they will be recycling the construction materials and debris.

Ms. Koester replied “yes”; she stated they will work with Clayco, but there are challenges with the lead based paint.

Marc Lopata asked if they will use Eco Recycling.

Ms. Koester stated that she believed so.

Marc Lopata asked what the City’s approved construction hours are.

Catherine Powers informed Marc that the City’s approved hours of construction are Monday through Friday from 7 a.m. to 6 p.m.

Mr. Kirschner stated that during the school year, work will not begin, as far as he is aware, until 8 a.m.

Bev Wagner asked if the same materials were used on the other newer buildings.

Mr. Kirschner replied “yes”.

Ms. Joann Boulton, 6416 Cecil, President of the Skinker Heights Association, thanked the City for the notification regarding this meeting and thanked Washington University representatives for their willingness to meet with the neighbors prior to this meeting. She stated that there were a total of 3 neighborhood meetings, all of which occurring on Sundays. She stated that this is a compromise that all can live with.

Ms. Cindy Johnson, 6450 Ellenwood, stated that she appreciates the relocation of the chiller plant, but is still somewhat concerned with noise. She asked if there was a similar chiller plant and if so, asks where it is. She stated that she is also concerned with a violation of the approved construction hours as was prevalent during Phase 4. She asked that the City be rigid when it comes to approving weekend work and asked that Clayco be discouraged from violating approved construction hours.

Marc Lopata asked if workers can show up at the site at 6 a.m. if 7 a.m. is the official start time.

Kevin O’Keefe advised the members that it is not illegal to be on the site prior to 7 a.m., it is illegal to begin “work” prior to 7 a.m. or to create construction “noise” (i.e. running construction trucks).

An unidentified woman in the audience commented that residents on University and Cecil will be able to look down onto the chiller plant.

Chairman Sanger asked the applicant to attempt to locate a similar chiller plant installation for comparison purposes.

Mr. Kirschner stated that it would be difficult to replicate environmental issues.

Being no further questions or comments, Debbie Igielnik made a motion to recommend approval of the conditional use permit to the Board of Aldermen. The motion was seconded by Steve Lichtenfeld and unanimously approved by the members.

Marc Lopata made a motion to approve the site plan per staff recommendations and with the added condition that the applicant go back to and work with the acoustical engineer regarding wind and line of sight conditions for the chiller plant for staff review and approval. The motion was seconded by Debbie Igielnik and unanimously approved by the members.

Jim Liberman made a motion to approve the architectural aspects of the project as submitted. The motion was seconded by Debbie Igielnik and unanimously approved by the members.

Chairman Sanger asked the members if they had anything they wanted to discuss.

Marc Lopata asked about double sided staff memorandums and allowing ½ size/scale drawings so as to reduce the amount of paper being used.

Catherine Powers advised Marc that the City buys recycled paper and recycles it again. She added that this is only one of several City commissions and the desire to maintain conformity. She stated that sometimes, detail is lost with the use of ½ size drawings.

Chairman Sanger asked about the possibility of using laptops versus paper.

Catherine Powers indicated that everyone would then have to submit digital drawings.

Marc Lopata commented that digital drawings are difficult to read.

Jim Liberman stated that he has observed that many times unnecessary plan sheets are included in the drawings that are not part of this Commission's review.

Debbie Igielnik asked that in the future, when she Chairs these meetings, that the minutes reflect the term "Chair" versus "Chairman".

Chairman Sanger asked if the fence at 7300 Wydown (pulled from the agenda by the applicant just prior to start of this meeting) runs along Wydown.

Catherine Powers stated that the "front" yard being referred to is Crestwood, not Wydown.

Being no further business for the Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board, this meeting adjourned at 6:55 p.m.

Recording Secretary